Single Board Member Redistricting Steering Public Hearing Thursday, November 15, 2012

Start Time: 6:00 p.m.

Location: Kathleen C. Wright Board Room 600 SE Third Avenue, Fort Lauderdale, FL 33301 Michael Rajner, Chair Marsha Ellison, Vice Chair

Agenda

1. Call to Order

Chair Michael Rajner called the meeting to order at 6:04 pm.

2. Pledge of Allegiance

Parliamentarian Ms. McDougle led the Pledge of Allegiance.

3. Roll Call

District 1 – Kristine Judeikis

District 1 – Russell Chard

District 2 – Marilyn Soltanipour

District 3 – Heather Cunniff

District 3 – Paul Eichner

District 5 – Roland Foulkes

District 5 – Roosevelt Walters

District 6 – Philip Busey

District 7 – Sheila Rose

District 7 – Ron Aronson

County Wide, At-Large 8 - Alan Ehrlich

County Wide, At-Large 8 - Marsha Ellison – Vice Chair

County Wide, At-Large 9 – Mary C. Fertig

Superintendent – Michael Rajner- Chair

The following committee members were absent from the meeting:

District 2 – Barbara Jones

District 4 – Latha Krishnaiyer

District 6 – Vacant

County Wide, At-Large 9 – Ernestine Price

4. Approval of November 15, 2012 Public Hearing Agenda

The agenda was adopted as amended.

5. Approval of November 8, 2012 Redistricting Meeting Minutes (attachment 5)

Ms. Rose motioned to add the parliamentarian comments to the November 8th minutes. The minutes were adopted as corrected.

6. Chair/Vice Chair's Report

No report

7. Staff Follow Up

7.1 Memorandum on Public Records from J. Paul Carlandi II- General Counsel

Chair Rajner stated that the memorandum would be forthcoming. All your binders, memos, emails you have, all of those items are considered public records. You have the option of storing them and making certain they are readily available, or if you want, the district will have a spot on the 4th floor. You can leave them here and Mark will bring them upstairs.

8. <u>Unfinished Business</u>

No unfinished business

9. Public Comment

Rose Waters stated that it was an awesome process, very enlightening for her and thanked the committee for it all.

10. New Business

10.1 Review and Edit draft 2011-2013 Broward County School Board Redistricting Steering Committee Report

Chair Rajner reviewed the packets in front of the committee

Page 1- is the new cover page

Page 2- is the list of the Board Members

Page 3- is the Redistricting Steering Committee Chronological Timeline (will be in the appendix)

Page 4-List of the committee members

Everything is correct except Sheila Rose name

Ms. Soltanipour asked if the Board Member's names will be changed.

Chair Rajner answered, No, the current Board will be reflected in the presentation for the Workshop on December 11, 2012.

Mr. Busey asked if the list would reflect all of the committee members.

Chair Rajner answered that prior members would be listed.

Mr. Busey agreed with all of the changes to the executive summary. He did not know who made the changes.

Chair Rajner answered that he had made the changes.

Mr. Walters commented that the SBBC and BCSB should be consistent in the report.

Mr. Eichner stated the formal name should be used.

Ms. Rose stated that the first paragraph should not focus on one problem.

Ms. Fertig liked the executive summary.

Mr. Chard commented that the problem was discovered after the process.

Board Member Ms. Dinnen stopped in.

Ms. Dinnen stated she stopped by to thank all of you. "This is really a lot of work and it is important."

Ms. Cunniff thanked Ms. Dinnen and added it has been challenging and rewarding.

Chair Rajner thanked Ms. Dinnen for her service as a School Board member.

Ms. Soltanipour asked if Mary's section could be added too.

Ms. Fertig commented that they are limited on words.

Chair Rajner stated we are using the first "where as" and changing the word "problem" to "discovered the fact."

Mr. Walters was concerned that the count of meetings were not consistent. Some show 18 and some show 19.

Chair Rajner clarified that there were nineteen meetings.

Mr. Chard commented that the numbers should be in numeric order. In the second paragraph third line "Public" is singular should be Public "was".

Ms. Fertig commented that the footnotes about Guiding Principles should be somewhere in the report.

Ms. Cunniff commented about the second paragraph fourth line should be broken down.

Mr. Aronson asked if the rankings should be in the executive summary.

Ms. Soltanipour agreed that the rankings should be in the executive summary.

Chair Rajner stated that the minutes from the last meeting needs to be revised.

Ms. Cunniff commented that the second to last sentence should say "the majority of the Committee."

Chair Rajner stated, "We are on the Introduction section."

Chair Rajner talked about using Roland's piece on diversity because they did not have the data broken down by specifics. Diversity is something we have struggled with due to the limitations of the US Census data

Ms. Rose commented that the diversity is still there, but not concentrated in the south part of the county.

Mr. Busey commented that he does not think some of this information is relevant. State we are very diverse and the number of nationalities and languages there are.

Chair Rajner commented he took two paragraphs out from Roland's presentation on map alternatives 2 and 3 and made modifications.

Mr. Aronson asked why is it necessary we need the last two sentences in paragraph four.

Ms. Judeikis commented that it doesn't have to be there.

Ms. Fetrig thought it was interesting and shows the diversity.

Mr. Foulkes commented that the 170 nations change depending on whom you talk to. The focus is the diversity. The only thing this does, is expand the definition of diversity.

Mr. Eichner stated he thinks it should be left in. It gives the School Board members the opportunity to read about the diversity.

Ms. Judeikis commented on the "world's global business executives". The parents are truck drivers that have kids in our schools. Most of my employees have kids in our schools.

Mr. Foulkes stated that the World City Magazine is written for executives. It encourages the executives to send their children to the School Board of Broward County.

Mr. Busey commented he likes the advertising point of the 170 nations, but is not sure if it should be nations or nationalities.

Mr. Foulkes commented that the magazine is getting the executives to move to Broward County and put their children into the public schools. It is true there are all different levels. It encourages them to use the public school system. It lists the public schools and private schools in it.

Mr. Busey wanted to know if it is 170 Countries or Nationalities.

Mr. Foulkes commented that it represents the parents or students of 170 nations.

Ms. Cunniff stated the schools are very diverse and the region is very diverse for many reasons. Immigrants come to south Florida from all over, and many of them are poor and do not have anything when they get here, so I move to strike that. I don't think it adds to the report.

Mr. Foulkes stated that staff has the current data from the district. Students that attend Broward County Schools come from 178 Countries and represent 53 languages.

Chair Rajner asked if the Committee was fine with using the wording that the District uses (what Mr. Foulkes read above).

Chair Rajner asked Mark to get a copy and email to him. It is for page five paragraph 4.

Mr. Chard commented that paragraph four, fourth line, has too many semi-colons. Change some to colons and the second semi colon with the word "and".

Chair Rajner moved on to Page 6. "I took this from other reports that I have seen."

Mr. Busey suggested, "This report is being submitted with recommendation".

Ms. Rose commented you don't have to say you are submitting it; they have it in their hands.

Mr. Busey commented to just say, "This report is submitted".

Chair Rajner read the statement back- Based on the Committee's collective work, and extensive input from the public, legal consideration, and guiding principles, this report is being submitted with recommendations for the 2011-2013 Redistricting Process.

Chair Rajner started page 7 "Methods."

Chair Rajner stated that Ms. Fertig requested we move the guiding principles to the method section. It would be the most appropriate place to put the guiding principles.

Ms. Judeikis asked if the Resolution would be included in the report.

Chair Rajner answered that it would be in the appendix or as a footnote and referenced.

Ms. Soltanipour commented that there are 17 committee members and two are vacant.

Chair Rajner answered we started with 19 and attendance varied at different meetings. Even though we have 17 members, there is room for two more.

Mr. Eichner commented that it is not accurate because Ms. Cunniff and I are gone.

Chair Rajner stated that the committee is still in existence, just suspended once we submit our recommendation(s). New Board members could appoint someone next week.

Chair Rajner asked Mr. Eichner how to word the reference of outside counsel in the General Counsel area in the table.

Mr. Eichner answered using another bullet and saying coordination of outside counsel.

Ms. Judeikis commented that the 5th bullet in the first area of the table should say "Develop and maintenance of website and online tools."

Ms. Fertig stated to insert the guiding principles on page 8 section 2 before or after the paragraph.

Chair Rajner commented that the list of meetings would be in the appendix. The Methodology is how we did it. The committee asked for a flow chart, but there is not one in there. The list of meetings is easier to read.

Ms. Judeikis added, "as long as you reference to the appendix."

Ms. Cunniff said the committee held 17 public meetings in addition to the 2 orientation meetings. The orientation meetings did not ask for public comments.

Chair Rajner told Mrs Cunniff to write it down and give it to him.

Chair Rajner stated that all of the meetings were open to the public. The orientation meetings were to orientate the public. Each orientation meetings had public comments. There was opportunity for the public to comment.

Mr. Busey suggested the need to be consistent through out the report.

Ms. Fertig commented having the meetings listed reinforced the effort to the public.

Mr. Aronson asked, "Why is Latino and Hispanic used."

Mr. Busey commented to be consistent and use "Hispanic."

Mr. Foulkes suggested we have to be clear if we are asked. We have to be prepared if asked to explain.

Mr. Busey suggested Hispanic no matter what the race.

Chair Rajner asked what is the consensus on Hispanic or Latino? We will use Hispanic as this is the term used by the US Census.

Mr. Foulkes commented on page 8, Paragraph 4, middle sentence, that black and white Hispanics are considered Hispanic.

Mr. Foulkes stated that he motioned in the Feb 9th meeting pertaining to staff maps.

Chair Rajner stated it should be re-worded based on Mr. Foulkes motion from Feb. 9th specifying department staff.

Ms. Cunniff commented that the committee did not request maps from staff.

Chair Rajner continued to page 9.

Mr. Ehrlich commented on Paragraph 3 after the first sentence, it should say, "committee members also discussed the strength and weaknesses of each map for their rankings."

Mr. Chard added to change the word "provided", in the second sentence, to the word "submitted".

Ms. Judeikis commented to put the rankings and comments in the appendix. Reference the appendix in "Methods."

Ms. Fertig commented to make it clear it is the individual comments, not group comments.

Chair Rajner stated, "We are in compliance with the motion by adding it in the appendix and referencing it in the report. Let's not use the word verbatim because the minutes are not verbatim."

Mr. Busey suggested explain what "scores" mean.

Mr. Aronson asked if the final rankings would be in bullet form.

Chair Rajner answered, "Yes, bullet form."

Ms. Fertig commented that many committee members included comments with their rankings.

Chair Rajner asked Ms. Fertig to try to honor everything that we are saying. Should refer to the minutes of the October meeting that was articulated.

chair Rajner refered everyone to Page 10.

Mr. Foulkes commented that see appendix should be in parenthesis that way we have consistence.

Ms. Soltanipour commented that in paragraph two, sentence 1, the number 7 should be written out.

Mr. Walters stated that we should be consistent in the report.

Ms. Rose added that someone trained in proofreading should do the proofreading.

Chair Rajner stated that Ms. McDougle will look up what numbers should be written out. Maps will be in order for page 11. Look at page 12.

Mr. Busey stated there was an error on the maps on the website.

Chair Rajner stated that Patrick uploaded the final four maps. Chair Rajner asked Mark to follow up with Patrick on the maps on the website. Mark checked the maps on the website and the maps are correct referring to the date on bottom of map.

Mr. Foulkes commented that his understanding the maps will be in the "Results." Under "Recommendations" are the last 4 maps highlighting the top map. Under "Results", have the three sections Original (12), Revised and Final (4).

Chair Rajner referred to appendix 6, move all the maps into "Results." Final 4 in preference order.

Mr. Busey commented that he would like all the maps in the report.

Ms. Cunniff commented that we produced 12 maps and we are recommending four maps.

Chair Rajner stated this is the result of our finding (while holding up the binder) and this is our recommendation (holding up certain pages in a section in the binder)

Mr. Foulkes commented that the public did provide maps and they should not be in the appendix.

Chair Rajner commented that there was no preference on maps when it came to ranking the committee members maps.

Ms. Cunniff stated she is recommending a map section with all the maps in that section.

Chair Rajner stated that the four final maps would be in the recommendation section.

Mr. Aronson referred back to page 9. He commented that after the bullets, refer to appendix with those four maps.

Ms. McDougle read back her notes from the last meeting and commented that someone, not sure whom, made a motion to include strength and weaknesses and it was unanimously voted on (On page 8 of the November 8th meeting minutes).

Mr. Busey read back part of the minutes from Page 8, 3rd to last line.

Chair Rajner stated that in the Results section there will be the 12 original maps, 2 revised maps and the 4 recommended maps.

Chair Rajner asked for a lead in sentence or two for Results.

Ms. Fertig commented that she would do the lead in sentence for Results.

Chair Rajner referred everyone to the Summary and Conclusion section.

Chair Rajner stated, "We have worked so hard and I want to make sure we walk away from this room with a document, that although may not be perfect and that we may not agree with all the statements in there as individuals, we as members of this committee can stand behind when the public questions it or asks questions to it. This represents a year's worth of our work and I want us to leave as a unified committee."

Mr. Eichner commented that "The 19 member" be changed to "The Committee". Change "the map makers were allowed" to be changed to "the opportunity to revise the maps".

Ms. Fertig commented that she would change the number of 16 maps to 18 maps.

Ms. Rose stated she thinks it is a dangerous thing to put the word "failure" in the report. She wrote down her changes and gave them to Chair Rajner.

Chair Rajner asked Mr. Eichner to make the changes on the draft and give to him at end of meeting. There should be a definition section in the report to clarify words.

Mr. Busey commented that staff sessions could be added to the sheet with the list of meetings on it.

Mr. Aronson commented to add the word "website" in paragraph two.

Mr. Eichner commented about changing the 2^{nd} line in paragraph 3. He will make the changes to the draft for Chair Rajner.

Ms. Fertig stated that every map did not meet the criteria.

Ms. Rose suggested about being careful stating maps did not meet criteria.

Chair Rajner stated he does not want to change what Ms. Fertig is trying to say but would like to state it in a positive way.

Mr. Busey felt that on the first bullet change 10% to 5%.

Ms. Fertig read the sentence back.....All four maps meet the criteria on total population when using the +/- 5% of the district population average 249,724.

Mr. Busey mentioned voting age population is used as a secondary critieria when testing minority access. Use the exact statement/quote that special counsel used on October 11th meeting page 9 of 40 top of page.

Mr. Eichner thought that on bullet 3, the word "also" should be kept.

Ms. Fertig thought it is not just the Innovation zones maps that showed which cities are intact. The impact on cities is apparent when reviewing the maps. I would prefer not to put in the Innovation zones.

Chair Rajner commented that saying "cities" is too broad. Some cities weighed in and some cities did not, so we have to be careful using the word cities.

Ms. Soltanipour added, "of the four maps."

Mr. Chard would like to strike the last sentence.

Chair Rajner stated by consensus to keep that statement.

Mr. Eichner commented on Bullet 4. Add the words "within the School Board Members district."

Ms. Fertig stated she feels very strong about this statement.

Mr. Eichner commented change "Testimony asserted" to "Testimony reveals."

Mr. Foulkes suggested being consistent in wording. His example: Black or African American and Latino or Hispanic.

Chair Rajner stated Ms. Fertig would rewrite bullet/item number 5.

Ms. Judeikis said minority influence is 30% or more.

Mr. Aronson asked if item number 6 was not being included.

Mr. Foulkes answered correct.

Chair Rajner stated this is not being considered. It is not appropriate in this report. Statement can come from public.

Mr. Busey thinks the first sentence is not true and do not agree with the rest.

Chair Rajner asked to take a show of hands on this because one side says it is true and the other side says it is not true and it was a public comment. There is truth on both sides. Ms. Fertig will rewrite the statement.

Mr. Foulkes added that all four maps were revised with the U.S. Census blocks.

Chair Rajner asked to have Patrick get the definition for U.S. Census Blocks. Last paragraph already crossed out.

Chair Rajner went on to Page 14.

Mr. Busey suggested giving this a different sub title.

Ms. Fertig commented on the number of meetings per month and time constraints and no time for a sub-committee.

Chair Rajner said we do have consensus on our report. He asked Ms. Fertig if he could re-write the report as the chair and talk about how there were some restrictions as a result of the resolution being a little too tight in some of the situations.

Ms. Fertig answered, "Just make sure you comment about the time."

Chair Rajner asked the committee members to please put their name on any revisions they hand to him.

Ms. Judeikis wrote the lead in sentence for "Recommendation."

Mr. Foulkes said he sent Patrick, in an email, his addition to page 17.

Chair Rajner asked Mark to remind him to get the additions from Patrick tomorrow.

Chair Rajner reviewed signing the report on page 18. Ms. McDougle will provide me the template for signing the report. Electronic signatures are on file with the District. Page 19 I will clean up.

10.2 Motion to approve the 2011-2013 Broward County School Board Redistricting Steering Committee Report

Mr. Walters made the **motion** to adopt the committee report as amended.

Ms. Soltanipour second the motion. The motion was passed unanimously.

10.3 Committee input on Redistricting Presentation for the School Board Workshop schedule for December 11, 2012

Mr. Rajner stated he is meeting with the Superintendent for recommendations on how to present the committee's recommendations to the Board. The report completed by December 3rd. It is going to the Board on December 11th.

10 Final Thoughts and Closing Comments

Mr. Walters thanked the chair for holding the committee together. It was enjoyable to work with many of you.

Ms. Soltanipour thanked the committee and wished everyone a Happy Thanksgiving.

Adjourn

The meeting was adjourned at 10:59 pm.

The minutes of the November 15th minutes are not officially approved by the committee because this was the last official meeting of the committee.

However, the chair has reviewed the minutes and find that they accurately reflect the business that was conducted at this meeting.

Michael Rajner, Chair

Date